

# Consultation for CACTI's FIM4Rv2 Assessment for Internet2 Trust and Identity



## Final Document Available

The final recommendations from CACTI are now available: <http://doi.org/10.26869/TI.112.1> Many thanks to all who participated across the Internet2 community and working groups for their passion in support of collaboration in the research and education community.

## Background

Internet2 Trust and Identity's [Community Architecture Committee for Trust and Identity \(CACTI\)](#) is seeking feedback on "FIM4Rv2 Assessment for Internet2 Trust and Identity." This is a white paper outlining gaps between the current state of Trust and Identity's offerings and the FIM4Rv2 recommendations from the research community in [Federated Identity Management for Research Collaborations](#), as well as recommendations for closing those gaps. It is expected that CACTI's recommendations will form the basis for ongoing efforts to enhance its support for research in the future.

## Final Document

[CACTI-FIM4R-Assessment-Final.pdf](#)

## Document for review/consultation

- FIM4Rv2 Assessment for Internet2 Trust and Identity ([Link to PDF attachment.](#))

## Aggregation of Input Received

- Google spreadsheet containing an aggregation of survey responses we received
  - [https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1wEKFiQDyZ9Z6q8i8QKGTcQXdwMrxr4w1LKkXK\\_kDzII/edit?usp=sharing](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1wEKFiQDyZ9Z6q8i8QKGTcQXdwMrxr4w1LKkXK_kDzII/edit?usp=sharing)

## Change Proposals and Feedback - We welcome your feedback/suggestions here

If you have comments that do not lend themselves well to the tabular format below, please create a new Google doc and link to it in the suggestion section below.

| Number | Current Text                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Proposed Text / Query / Suggestion                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Proposer                                                            | +1 (add your name here if you agree with the proposal) | Action                                                                                                                        |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1      | CILogon has become a critical service for existing collaborations as well as a foundation for broader collaboration, but <b>there is currently no sustainability model.</b>                                                             | CILogon has become a critical service for existing collaborations as well as a foundation for broader collaboration, but <b>its current subscription-based sustainability model could benefit from more stable, long-term support.</b>                                 | <a href="#">James Basney (illinois.edu)</a>                         |                                                        | The text will be modified as suggested.                                                                                       |
| 2      | (p36, sB.11, para #2)<br>The number of participating national identity federations (IDFs) has grown from a handful to 18 in mid 2017, enabling <b>user's</b> from 1577 organisations to use single sign-on to login to CLARIN services. | The number of participating national identity federations (IDFs) has grown from a handful to 18 in mid 2017, enabling <b>users</b> from 1577 organisations to use single sign-on to login to CLARIN services.                                                          | <a href="#">Jon Miner (wisc.edu)</a>                                |                                                        | This was in the original FIM4Rv2 paper ("Federated Identity Management for Research Collaborations"), which is already final. |
| 3      | (Gap3 - page 10 IdP of last resort)<br><br>Researchers from institutions that have not federated their IAM systems are not well served. An IdP of Last Resort that releases R&S attributes and can be used internationally is needed.   | Researchers from institutions that have not federated their IAM systems are not well served. An IdP or perhaps a set of regional IdPs (hosted in Research Computing facilities) of Last Resort that releases R&S attributes and can be used internationally is needed. | Warren Curry<br><br>(ufl.edu)                                       |                                                        | The text will be modified as suggested.                                                                                       |
| 4      | Recommendations related to IdPs as a Service and IdPs of Last Resort.                                                                                                                                                                   | Be more explicit about which of these is indicated, and how they support research activities.                                                                                                                                                                          | <a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a> |                                                        | The recommendations related to IdPaaS and IdPoLR will be made more explicit.                                                  |

|    |                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                     |                                |                                                                                                                                                                     |
|----|---------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 5  | OIDC                                              | There should be more explicit recommendations regarding use cases that are not handled well with SAML                                                                                                                                 | <a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a> | <a href="#">Chris Phillips</a> | The recommendation has been modified to be more explicit.                                                                                                           |
| 6  | Timeline                                          | Consider adding a timeline for recommended actions.                                                                                                                                                                                   | <a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a> |                                | The decision was not to provide a timeline but to emphasize the need for a roadmap as a next step.                                                                  |
| 7  | The paper's focus on recommendations for InCommon | Consider adding recommendations for the other "strata" in the FIM4Rv2 report (e.g., identity providers, research service providers, software developers).                                                                             | <a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a> |                                | The decision was not to expand the scope of the recommendations, but there is already text highlighting Internet2's unique role to foster action by other "strata." |
| 8  | Security                                          | Consider more explicit recommendations for SIRTFI, proactive security assessments, etc.                                                                                                                                               | <a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a> |                                | Text has been added to specify compliance with SIRTFI, but SIRTFI-specific recommendations were considered out of scope.                                            |
| 9  | Outreach                                          | Consider help for campuses to bridge the gap between researchers and their IAM staff. Also explore ways to reach out to researchers directly.                                                                                         | <a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a> |                                | Text has been added to recommend information exchange and partnerships between these communities.                                                                   |
| 10 |                                                   | Improve clarity of collaboration as a service pivoting on adopters (both sites and projects) understanding the tools, readiness and/or maturity of campus IAM solutions to allow ease of use such that adoption barriers are minimal. | Nov 9 Author's meeting                                              |                                | The text has been edited for clarity.                                                                                                                               |
| 11 |                                                   | For each of the authors listed, please provide the ORCID ID where possible.<br><br>Nicholas Roy: <a href="https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6515-4316">https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6515-4316</a>                                            | Emily Eisbruch                                                      |                                | ORCIDs have been added to the list of authors.                                                                                                                      |

#### See Also

- [CACTI-Discuss-Topic-Internet2 FIM4R Assessment](#)
- [CACTI - Community Architecture Committee for Trust and Identity Home](#)
- [Trust and Identity Consultations Home](#)