

# Consultation for CACTI's FIM4Rv2 Assessment for Internet2 Trust and Identity

## Final Document Available

The final recommendations from CACTI are now available: <http://doi.org/10.26869/TI.112.1> Many thanks to all who participated across the Internet2 community and working groups for their passion in support of collaboration in the research and education community.

## Background

Internet2 Trust and Identity's [Community Architecture Committee for Trust and Identity \(CACTI\)](#) is seeking feedback on "FIM4Rv2 Assessment for Internet2 Trust and Identity." This is a white paper outlining gaps between the current state of Trust and Identity's offerings and the FIM4Rv2 recommendations from the research community in [Federated Identity Management for Research Collaborations](#), as well as recommendations for closing those gaps. It is expected that CACTI's recommendations will form the basis for ongoing efforts to enhance its support for research in the future.

## Final Document

[CACTI-FIM4R-Assessment-Final.pdf](#)

## Document for review/consultation

- FIM4Rv2 Assessment for Internet2 Trust and Identity ([Link to PDF attachment.](#))

## Aggregation of Input Received

- Google spreadsheet containing an aggregation of survey responses we received
  - [https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1wEKFiqDyZ9Z6q8i8QKGTcQXdwMrxr4w1LKkXK\\_kDzIl/edit?usp=sharing](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1wEKFiqDyZ9Z6q8i8QKGTcQXdwMrxr4w1LKkXK_kDzIl/edit?usp=sharing)

## Change Proposals and Feedback - We welcome your feedback/suggestions here

If you have comments that do not lend themselves well to the tabular format below, please create a new Google doc and link to it in the suggestion section below.

Number	Current Text	Proposed Text / Query / Suggestion	Proposer	+1 (add your name here if you agree with the proposal)	Action
1	CILogon has become a critical service for existing collaborations as well as a foundation for broader collaboration, but there is currently no sustainability model.	CILogon has become a critical service for existing collaborations as well as a foundation for broader collaboration, but its current subscription-based sustainability model could benefit from more stable, long-term support.	<a href="#">James Basney (illinois.edu)</a>		The text will be modified as suggested.
2	(p36, sB.11, para #2) The number of participating national identity federations (IDFs) has grown from a handful to 18 in mid 2017, enabling user's from 1577 organisations to use single sign-on to login to CLARIN services.	The number of participating national identity federations (IDFs) has grown from a handful to 18 in mid 2017, enabling users from 1577 organisations to use single sign-on to login to CLARIN services.	<a href="#">Jon Miner (wisc.edu)</a>		This was in the original FIM4Rv2 paper ("Federated Identity Management for Research Collaborations"), which is already final.
3	(Gap3 - page 10 IdP of last resort) Researchers from institutions that have not federated their IAM systems are not well served. An IdP of Last Resort that releases R&S attributes and can be used internationally is needed.	Researchers from institutions that have not federated their IAM systems are not well served. An IdP or perhaps a set of regional IdPs (hosted in Research Computing facilities) of Last Resort that releases R&S attributes and can be used internationally is needed.	<a href="#">Warren Curry (ufl.edu)</a>		The text will be modified as suggested.
4	Recommendations related to IdPs as a Service and IdPs of Last Resort.	Be more explicit about which of these is indicated, and how they support research activities.	<a href="#">Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando</a>		The recommendations related to IdPaaS and IdPoLR will be made more explicit.

5	OIDC	There should be more explicit recommendations regarding use cases that are not handled well with SAML	Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando	Chris Phillips	The recommendation has been modified to be more explicit.
6	Timeline	Consider adding a timeline for recommended actions.	Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando		The decision was not to provide a timeline but to emphasize the need for a roadmap as a next step.
7	The paper's focus on recommendations for InCommon	Consider adding recommendations for the other "strata" in the FIM4Rv2 report (e.g., identity providers, research service providers, software developers).	Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando		The decision was not to expand the scope of the recommendations, but there is already text highlighting Internet2's unique role to foster action by other "strata."
8	Security	Consider more explicit recommendations for SIRTFI, proactive security assessments, etc.	Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando		Text has been added to specify compliance with SIRTFI, but SIRTFI-specific recommendations were considered out of scope.
9	Outreach	Consider help for campuses to bridge the gap between researchers and their IAM staff. Also explore ways to reach out to researchers directly.	Oct-18-2018 Open CACTI meeting at TechEx in Orlando		Text has been added to recommend information exchange and partnerships between these communities.
10		Improve clarity of collaboration as a service pivoting on adopters (both sites and projects) understanding the tools, readiness and/or maturity of campus IAM solutions to allow ease of use such that adoption barriers are minimal.	Nov 9 Author's meeting		The text has been edited for clarity.
11		For each of the authors listed, please provide the ORCID ID where possible.  Nicholas Roy: <a href="https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6515-4316">https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6515-4316</a>	Emily Eisbruch		ORCID IDs have been added to the list of authors.

#### See Also

- [CACTI-Discuss-Topic-Internet2 FIM4R Assessment](#)
- [CACTI - Community Architecture Committee for Trust and Identity Home](#)
- [Trust and Identity Consultations Home](#)